## The glueball spectrum with $N_{f}=4$ light fermions

## $27^{\text {th }}-$ August 2022

Andreas Athenodorou The Cyprus Institute D 0000-0003-4600-4245

In collaboration with Jacob Finkenrath, Adam Lantos and Michael Teper

## General considerations 1

O Recently for Pure Gauge:

- Extracted the masses of lightest glueballs for all 5 irreducible reps $\left(A_{1}, A_{2}, E, T_{1}, T_{2}\right)$ of cubic rotation group and $P= \pm, C= \pm: N \in[2,12]$, improving older works: M. Teper, 1987; Morningstar and Peardon, 1997; Lucini, Rago, and Rinaldi, 2010
- We extrapolated to the continuum limit
- For enough $N \in[2,12]$, that we extrapolated to the $N=\infty$ limit
- We have identified continuum spins $J$ for the lightest states

Control systematic errors: multiglueball states; di-torelons; topological freezing
(0) Publications:
© SU(3): AA and M. Teper, JHEP 11 (2020), 172, e-Print: 2007.06422 [hep-lat]
© SU( $\infty$ ): AA and M. Teper, JHEP 12 (2021), 082, e-Print: 2106.00364 [hep-lat]

## General considerations 2

- Glueball spectrum in $\operatorname{SU}(3)$ has a phenomenological importance
© What is the effect of the light dynamical quarks?
- Very noisy correlators - requires lots of statistics
- Extract the spectrum with $N_{f}=4$ light quarks with $m_{\pi} \approx 250 \mathrm{MeV}$
- Ensembles with 20 k configurations
- Investigate the low-lying spectrum of $A_{1}^{++}$with $N_{f}=2+1+1$ light quarks
- Ideally, perform an extended investigation for $N_{f}=2+1+1$ light quarks
(O Sar: Chen, $2021\left(N_{f}=2+1, m_{\pi}=140 \mathrm{MeV}\right)$, Gregory, $2012\left(N_{f}=2+1, m_{\pi}=360 \mathrm{MeV}\right)$,
- See also Davide Vadacchino's plenary: A REVIEW ON GLUEBALL HUNTING


## Lattice Setup - fermions

(0) We use ensembles with Clover improved Twisted mass fermions produced with

- $N_{f}=4$ degenerate light flavors at three different lattice spacings
- $N_{f}=2+1+1$ ( 2 degenerate light flavors) + strange + charm
(0) We use the Iwasaki improved action

$$
S_{G}=\frac{\beta}{3} \sum_{x}\left(c_{0} \sum_{\substack{\mu, \nu=1 \\ \mu<\nu}}^{4}\left[1-\operatorname{Re} \operatorname{Tr}\left(U_{x, \mu \nu}^{1 \times 1}\right)\right]+c_{1} \sum_{\substack{\mu, \nu=1 \\ \mu \neq \nu}}^{4}\left[1-\operatorname{Re} \operatorname{Tr}\left(U_{x, \mu \nu}^{1 \times 2}\right)\right]\right)
$$

(0) The fermionic sector is implemented using the twisted mass formulation of lattice QCD, which for two mass degenerate quarks takes the form


$$
S_{F}^{l}=a^{4} \sum_{x} \bar{\chi}^{(l)}(x)\left(D_{W}[U]+\frac{i}{4} c_{S W} \sigma^{\mu \nu} \mathcal{F}^{\mu \nu}[U]+m_{0, l}+i \mu_{l} \gamma_{5} \tau^{3}\right) \chi^{(l)}(x)
$$

|  | $\beta$ | $c_{s w}$ | $\mu$ | $L$ | $a m_{P S}$ | $t_{0} / a^{2}$ |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $N_{F}=4$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| cA4.60.16 | 1.726 | 1.74 | 0.006 | 16 | $0.2313(23)$ | $3.565(39)$ |  |
| cB4.06.16 | 1.778 | 1.69 | 0.006 | 16 | $0.2652(53)$ | $4.947(62)$ |  |
| cB4.06.24 | 1.778 | 1.69 | 0.006 | 24 | $0.1580(8)$ | $4.667(17)$ |  |
| cC4.05.24 | 1.836 | 1.6452 | 0.005 | 24 | $0.1546(20)$ | $6.422(48)$ |  |
| $N_{F}=2+1+1$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| cA211.53.24 | 1.726 | 1.74 | 0.005 | 24 | $0.1661(4)$ | $2.342(6)$ |  |
| cA211.25.32 | 1.726 | 1.74 | 0.003 | 32 | $0.1253(1)$ | $2.392(4)$ |  |



## Lattice Setup - Pure Gauge

(0) We generate Pure Gauge ensembles

- For several values of the lattice spacing $(\beta)$
(C) For $N=2$ to $N=12$
(0) We use the Wilson action

$$
\begin{aligned}
S_{L} & =\beta \sum_{p}\left\{1-\frac{1}{N} \operatorname{Re} \operatorname{Tr} U_{p}\right\} \\
\beta & =\frac{2 N}{g^{2}}
\end{aligned}
$$

Topological Freezing

Correlation Length:
$\left\langle Q(i s) Q\left(i s+\xi_{Q}\right)\right\rangle /\left\langle Q^{2}\right\rangle=e^{-1}$




## Quantum Numbers

(0) On the lattice, continuous rotational symmetry broken to the symmetry of the octahedral group

Irreducible representations are $A_{1}, A_{2}, E, T_{1}, T_{2}$
(0) We use gluonic operators in irreducible representations of the octahedral group

Near the continuum limit, full rotational symmetry is recovered
(0) Continuous spin obtained from the subduced representations of the rotation group $S O$ (3) restricted to the octahedral irreducible representations

| $J$ | $A_{1}$ | $A_{2}$ | $E$ | $T_{1}$ | $T_{2}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 |
| 2 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 |
| 3 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 1 |
| 4 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 1 |

(0) In addition, Parity and Charge Conjugation $P= \pm, C= \pm$

## Correlation Function



$$
\begin{aligned}
C(t)= & \left\langle\Phi^{\dagger}(t) \Phi(0)\right\rangle \\
= & \left\langle\Phi^{\dagger}(0) e^{-H t} \Phi(0)\right\rangle \\
= & |\langle 0| \Phi(0)| v a c\rangle\left.\right|^{2} e^{-E_{0} t} \\
& \left.+\sum_{n=1}|\langle n| \Phi(0)| v a c\right\rangle\left.\right|^{2} e^{-E_{n} t} \\
& t \rightarrow \infty \\
& |\langle 0| \Phi(0)| v a c\rangle\left.\right|^{2} e^{-E_{0} t}
\end{aligned}
$$

(0) We calculate the effective energies
$\lim _{t \rightarrow \infty}\left[-\ln \left(\frac{C(t)}{C(t-a)}\right)\right]=a E_{0}$
Example of effective masses

We use the variational calculation to extract the excitation spectrum


## Extraction of the Excitation Spectrum

Construct a large basis of Operators $\Phi_{i}: i=1,2, \ldots$ with right quantum numbers
© Calculate the correlation function (Matrix) $C_{i j}(t)=\left\langle\Phi_{i}^{\dagger}(t) \Phi_{j}(0)\right\rangle$
(0) Diagonalize the matrix $C^{-1}(t=0) C(t=m a)$

O Extract the eigenvectors
© Extract the correlator for each state $\left(\sim \mathrm{e}^{-E_{n} t}\right)$
C By fitting the results, we extract the mass (energy) for each state

O This is the so called Generalized Eigenvalue Problem (GEVP)

$$
\left.\left.\left[\begin{array}{ccccc}
{\left[A_{1}^{P C}\right]} & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\
0 & {\left[A_{2}^{P C}\right]} & 0 & 0 & 0 \\
0 & 0 & {\left[E^{P C}\right]} & 0 & 0 \\
0 & 0 & 0 & {\left[T_{1}^{P C}\right]} & 0 \\
0 & 0 & 0 & 0
\end{array}\right] T_{2}^{P C}\right]\right] .
$$

M. Lüscher and U. Wolff, Nucl. Phys. B339 (1990) 222-252.

## Lattice Operators

0. Operators have been constructed by linear combinations of:


## Lattice Operators

(0) Operators have been constructed by linear combinations of:


Recent results on Pure Gauge Theory

$S U(\infty)$




Recent results on Pure Gauge Theory

$S U(\infty)$



## Results for Planar Limit

## (0) Extrapolations to the Large- $N$ limit



$J^{P C}=0^{++}$ground ( $(\bullet)$ and first excited ( $■$ );
$0^{-+}$ground ( ${ }^{\circ}$ ) and first excited ( $\square$ ).
With extrapolations to $N=\infty$ from $N=2-12$.

$J^{P C}=2^{++}$ground ( $\cdot$ ) and first excited ( $\circ$ ) tensors; $2^{-+}$ ground ( $\square$ ) and first excited ( $\square$ ) pseudotensors; lightest $2^{+-}(*)$ and the lightest $2^{--}(\diamond)$.

## Results for SU(3) Pure Gauge, continuum extrapolations





Asymptotic behaviour: $\sim a^{2}\left[\frac{1}{-\log (a \Lambda)}\right]^{\hat{\gamma}_{1}}$, Husung et al, Eur.Phys.J.C 80 (2020) 3, 200

## Topological Charge and scale setting

- We calculate the topological

$$
\mathcal{Q}=\int d^{4} x q(x)
$$

- With topological charge densitv:
$q(x)=\frac{1}{32 \pi^{2}} \epsilon_{\mu \nu \rho \sigma} \operatorname{Tr}\left\{G_{\mu \nu} G_{\rho \sigma}\right\}$
- We use the Clover definition:
$C_{\mu \nu}(x)=\frac{1}{4} \operatorname{Im}(\square)$
- We smooth the UV fluctuations using the Wilson Flow.
( We solve the evolution equations:
$\dot{V}_{\mu}(x, \tau)=-g_{0}^{2}\left[\partial_{x, \mu} S_{G}(V(\tau))\right] V_{\mu}(x, \tau)$ $V_{\mu}(x, 0)=U_{\mu}(x)$,
- With link derivative defined as:

$$
\begin{aligned}
\partial_{x, \mu} S_{G}(U) & =\left.i \sum_{a} T^{a} \frac{\mathrm{~d}}{\mathrm{~d} s} S_{G}\left(e^{i s Y^{a}} U\right)\right|_{s=0} \\
& \equiv i \sum_{a} T^{a} \partial_{x, \mu}^{(a)} S_{G}(U)
\end{aligned}
$$

- We can define a scale parameter $t_{0}$ $F(t)=t^{2}\langle E(t)\rangle$ where $E(t)=\frac{1}{4} B_{\mu \nu}^{2}(t)$

$$
\left.F(t)\right|_{t=t_{0}(c)}=c
$$

(0) With $c=0.3$.




## Effective Masses

Correlation functions of specific operators used for extracting the spectrum

$$
\begin{aligned}
C(t) & =\left\langle\Phi^{\dagger}(t) \Phi(0)\right\rangle=\left\langle\Phi^{\dagger}(0) e^{-H t} \Phi(0)\right\rangle \\
& \left.\left.=|\langle 0| \Phi(0)| v a c\rangle\left.\right|^{2} e^{-E_{0} t}+\sum_{n=1}|\langle n| \Phi(0)| v a c\right\rangle\left.\right|^{2} e^{-E_{n} t} \xrightarrow{t \rightarrow \infty}|\langle 0| \Phi(0)| v a c\right\rangle\left.\right|^{2} e^{-E_{0} t}
\end{aligned}
$$

We calculate the effective energy $\lim _{t \rightarrow \infty}\left[-\ln \left(\frac{C(t)}{C(t-a)}\right)\right]=a E_{0}$
Effective Energies for cB4.06.24




## The $\boldsymbol{N}_{f}=4$ Glueball Spectrum



## The $\boldsymbol{N}_{f}=4$ Glueball Spectrum



The $\boldsymbol{N}_{f}=4$ Glueball Spectrum


The $\boldsymbol{A}_{\mathbf{1}}^{++}$channel with $\boldsymbol{N}_{\boldsymbol{f}}=\mathbf{2 + 1}+\mathbf{1}$ fermions


## Observations

(C) Observations for Pure Gauge:

- $N=3$ 'close to' $N=\infty$ : modest $O\left(1 / N^{2}\right)$ correction suffices
- $J^{P C}=0^{++}$scalar is the lightest glueball
- $J^{P C}=2^{++}$next with mass $\sim 1.5 \times 0^{++}$
- $J^{P C}=0^{-+}$mass is next, very close to $2^{++}$
- $J^{P C}=1^{+-}$is next, very close to first excited $0^{++}$
- Other $C=-$ states are much heavier
(0) Observations for QCD with light dynamical quarks
- $A_{1}^{++}$includes an additional state
- $A_{1}^{++}$ground state depends strongly on $m_{\pi}$
- $J^{P C}=2^{++}$ground state is consistent with Pure Gauge $S U(3)$
- $J^{P C}=0^{-+}$ground state is very close to $2^{++}$
(0) The glueball masses are affected negligibly by dynamical quarks



